Exploring possible solutions that emerge from below

The experiences of Shack Dwellers International

Presented by Sheela Patel
Director SPARC on behalf of NSDF, Mahila Milan and SPARC
Chair SDI Board on behalf the transnational federations of the urban poor who are its members

3rd May 2018 at MIT, USA
Introduction
Who am I and what is the position of the Indian alliance and SDI

• In India we are an alliance of NSDF, Mahila Milan and SPARC

• SDI is a transnational alliance of 33 country federations in Asia, Africa, and Latin America

• Set up in 1996 legally this movement of informal settlement dwellers have unique practices

• It seeks to produce global accountability to produce local solutions exchange of local to local knowledge exchange
Where we are present in India:
9 states  65 cities
Slum/Shack Dwellers International (SDI) now operates in 33+countries across Asia, Africa and Latin America.

Transnational (SDI) National (NSDF, Mahila Milan)

City

Province

Global Networks for local transformation
How the poor view housing?

Squatter speak:

In the past and sometimes in the present: “Your work is to demolish, ours is to build”

Future: “Give us secure locations and we will build our houses. Work with us!”

Demolitions to development that is sustainable
In most first generation homes for very poor migrants, homes look like this ...
Or like this when peri urban villages get gulped by urban boundries
Or become like this with recycled materials if they feel somewhat secure
Then move vertically as there is no space to grow horizontally.
Critical elements of that perspective

- Almost all poor households squat on vacant land because there is work for them in cities but no arrangement to stay.
- They have to defend that right until the state and city accept they are not going back to their villages!
We started working with pavement dwellers in Mumbai in 1980s

After beginning to work together SPARC, Mahila Milan and NSDF began a series of explorations that led to what SDI calls the basic rituals of federation building

At the center were women’s collectives that remain the nucleus of our work
We want to see women leading their families out of urban poverty

Help us make that happen!

Sisters are doing it for themselves

Help us accelerate that!
This process seeks to focus on:

• Creating an identity for the urban poor
• Demonstrating their capacity to add value to city-wide solutions
• Give them the right to choice and aspirations
• Produce entrepreneurial behavior among the poor
• Bring them on to the problem solving table in cities

The poor pay informally for bad services, now we want to pool that capacity to create a demand for good quality housing and infrastructure.
The ritual of savings
Savings and credit Mahila Milan style

• Daily savings and loans managed by women’s collectives

• Community ATMs anytime anywhere any amount

• “we collect people not just money”
The ritual of enumeration

- Every community collects information about themselves
- The alliance works to make it recognized by the state
- Enumerations mobilize and organize communities
The ritual of Precedent Setting

• Breaking of rules and norms to demonstrate what works for the poor.

• Designing of scaling federation style.

• Training communities to drive the change process.
The Story of Kisseni, The Slum Toilet and Community Center at Kampala, Uganda

Through involvement of the Kampala Municipal Council, The Ministry of Housing and Shack Dwellers International (SDI) an intervention to produce new partnerships has emerged.
More Precedent Setting

Funicular Cement Roofing tiles

Women make these roofing tiles and have trained each other to make them and demonstrate that even if 10 men stand on the roof it can bear the load… Both the government and communities need this reassurance!
Federation exchanges in large numbers
The ritual of exchanges: local, national and international

Exchanges now have ministers and administrators learning from each other.
Pavement dwellers of Mumbai: The story of “we the invisible“
Pavement dwellers and Milan Nagar

Mahila Milan had designed their home which we developed into a building with the same interior design that many other buildings copied.
The story of railway slum dwellers federation
Producing housing stock where people wanted to relocate

All land owners who had informal settlements on their lands came to the alliance for a joint venture to explore this possibility as well.
Using state subsidies

When Pune Mahila Milan began to explore housing though access to subsides, South Africa federation inspired them

South Africa: City federations wanted to upgrade a large settlement through their participation using state subsidies
They also learnt about incremental upgrading on footprints from Kambimotto in Nairobi, Kenya.

Houses in Kambimoto were very small and every dense. Mongano got the city to call it a special planning area which gave them concessions to design it the way they wanted.
Nairobi, Kenya Footprint concept
Upgraded settlement at Kambimoto, Nairobi
In Pune the BSUP allocation for 20000 households was not getting operational.

Mahila Milan negotiated with the city to build the first 2000 houses in five neighborhoods.
Every household was assessed by communities and mapped

Mahila Milan negotiated with the municipality to change many norms and standards to close the gap between what people wanted and what the city required from them to give them the subsidy.
Extending subsidies and locating katcha houses

Instead of demolishing all houses, they located the houses which were katcha or semi pucca thereby reaching the poorest and making subsidies reach more settlements.
Working on layouts and changing standards
Working with documentation to access subsidy
Malawi: women design their houses

women made a deal with the state for land
Yet the biggest challenges are the towns within large cities. Dharavi in Mumbai is one such town.
For over 70 years the city water went through Dharavi but residents did not get any water until they made holes and drew the water with illegal pumps that led to an outbreak of jaundice in the city.
DHARAVI redevelopment plan 2004

Dharavi
TOTAL AREA : 2403571 sq.mts.
240.3571 Ha

Sector - IV
TOTAL AREA : 351497 sq.mts.
35.1497 Ha

TOTAL AREAS: DHARAVI & SECTOR - IV
In 2004 the state government decided to redevelop Dharavi and announced it was a special development zone. Communities did not accept it and began to explore if they could suggest an alternate plan.
CLUSTER BREAK-UP

17: AREA: 15663 smt
NO. OF TENEMENTS: 841

18: AREA: 10900 smt
NO. OF TENEMENTS: 734

19: AREA: 13457 smt
NO. OF TENEMENTS: 924

20: AREA: 6433 smt
NO. OF TENEMENTS: 168

21: AREA: 6639 smt
NO. OF TENEMENTS: 582

22: AREA: 12190 smt
NO. OF TENEMENTS: 440

23: AREA: 3436 smt
NO. OF TENEMENTS: 143
While the residents plan was developed, the state to date has not accepted it although in 2014 the original redevelopment plan was cancelled.
4 new slums bigger than Dharavi

Mega Shanties Move Northwards From Island City

Clara Lewis | TNN

Mumbai: Dharavi, spread over 557 acres and home to nearly three lakh people, is no longer Asia’s largest slum. There are at least four larger contenders for the dubious distinction in Mumbai itself, some of them three times the size of Dharavi.

NEW KINGS OF SLUMBIA: P 4

Dharavi stands dwarfed, P 4

4. Mankhurd-Govandi belt
3. Bhandup along the Yeoor hill slopes flanking the park on the east
2. Kurla-Ghatkopar belt
1. Dindoshi, along Yogil hills on the western side of the national park

ISLAND CITY SPARED

Dharavi has lost its status as Asia’s largest slum. It’s now rivalled and dwarfed by four slum clusters in Mumbai itself.

Dharavi has only one slum reserve. These four new slums have none. There are very few clusters left in the island city: Dharavi, Antop Hill, Geeta Nagar, Ambekar Nagar, Worli village.

NO RESERVATIONS

55% of the slums are on land reserved for housing. Contrary to popular perception, only 27% of the slum pockets have come up on open spaces or land reserved as natural reserves.

POP GOES MUMBAI

In 1991, there were only 23.3 lakh (24.5%) slumdwellers in the city. In 2011, an estimated 78% of the city’s population lives in slums. Population density in the suburbs is highest at 26,925 persons per sq km.

GROUND REALITY

With realty prices climbing the middle-class and the low-income groups began moving northward.

“AMITA BHIDE, TATA INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

...
Mukuru Special Planning Area in Nairobi is now a special planning area.
## The opportunity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Rental Income</th>
<th>Electricity Savings</th>
<th>Water Savings</th>
<th>Unlocked Land Value</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Number of Households</strong></td>
<td>138,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Number Households</strong></td>
<td>126,960</td>
<td>138,000</td>
<td>138,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Monthly Payment per Household</strong></td>
<td>1,500</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>261</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Collected Monthly</strong></td>
<td>190,440,000</td>
<td>17,689,084</td>
<td>36,018,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>3,045,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Collected Annually</strong></td>
<td>2,285,280,000</td>
<td>212,269,019</td>
<td>432,216,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>73,112,225,691</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Collected in 15 Years (By 2030)</strong></td>
<td>60,399,950,400.00</td>
<td>3,184,035,291</td>
<td>6,483,240,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Gazette Notice 7654
Mukuru Special Planning Area Profile

- 100,561 Households
- Housing density up to 240 households per acre
- 7 Billion Ksh annual economy
- Households pay up to 142% more for electricity, 300% more for water, and for every access to a toilet
- Mukuru sits on 647.8 acres which require planning and legal solutions to make it available for slum upgrading
- The majority of structures are informally owned, while 94% of Mukuru residents are renters
- Mukuru consists of 30 villages governed by traditional administrative structures that are disconnected from service provision
- The majority of children in Mukuru attend one of over 150 informal schools in the settlement

- Poor air quality exposes Mukuru residents to hazardous levels of particulate matter exceeding WHO guidelines
- Large sections of Mukuru are built on land fill, making the settlement vulnerable to severe flooding
- Contaminated water, and poor waste management, lead to a high prevalence of gastrointestinal health complications
- Insufficient access to water and sanitation facilities in Mukuru places an extremely high safety and dignity burden on women and children
- All health facilities in Mukuru are private or NGO based, there are no public health centers

An average of 234 households share one public water tap
An average x households share one toilet (ask Jane)

Figure 1. 30 villages & 13 planning segments in the Mukuru SPA
(KNOW)
YOUR CITY
So how should we view the role of engineers, architects and planners in the lives of the majority of city dwellers in the global south?

Treat them like beneficiaries or as partners who have something to teach us about scalable solutions?